

The Columbia River Treaty and Local Interests: A Shared Responsibility

Appendix A: Table of Case Studies Considered

Case Study	Geography	Legal Basis	Purpose & Function	Implementation Arrangement	Members	Role of Local Interests	Stakeholder Participation	Comments relative to Columbia River Basin
Accepted For Analysis								
1. Pacific Salmon Treaty	Rivers & coastal waters of AK, WA, ID, OR, BC, Yukon Terr.	Treaty	Conserve salmon & divide harvest	Pacific Salmon Commission	8 Commissioners appointed by federal governments	First Nations and fishers informed during negotiations, involved in implementation	Yes	Provides a good place to begin; semi-shared governance
2. Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement	5 Great Lakes and St. Lawrence River	Bi-national Agreement	Restore & maintain integrity of waters	Executive Committee; multi-layered	Sovereigns & stakeholders	Consulted during negotiation; serve on EC	Yes	Another good place to begin; semi-shared governance
3. Great Lakes Levels Orders	Lake Superior, Huron, Michigan, Ontario and St. Lawrence River	Boundary Waters Treaty – IJC Orders of Approval	To regulate lake levels on boundary/transboundary Great Lakes-St. Lawrence River.	The IJC created the Lake Superior Board of Control and the Lake Ontario-St. Lawrence River Board.	Officials from federal, provincial and state governments as well as inclusion of stakeholders and local interests	Public involvement and consultation in developing management plans and involvement on the Lake Ontario-St. Lawrence River Board.	Yes	Bargaining for optimal utilization on behalf of diverse interests in the narrow framework of a Treaty and protected interests.
4. Souris River Agreement	Watershed between Sask, Manitoba and North Dakota 435 miles	Bi-national Treaty	Water Supply and Flood Control	International Souris River Board under the IJC	International Souris River Board includes representatives of local government	Involved as members of International Souris River Board under the IJC	Yes	Local Interests involved in the Int. Souris River Board and parallels with CRT
5. Colorado River Compact / Glen Canyon Dam Adaptive Management Program	7 western States and Mexico	“Law of the River”	Allocate and manage water	Compact and treaty - Adaptive Management Working Group (AMWG)	Adaptive Management Working Group (AMWG) Membership in the AMWG includes Native American Tribes located in the affected area, representatives of the basin States, environmental organizations, relevant State and Federal agencies, and recreation and power interests.	Not involved originally, but play a greater role Glen Canyon Dam Adaptive Management Program - Stakeholder Participation and adaptive management as decision makers and stakeholders	Yes	Example of how a narrow agreement can be a springboard for other more adaptive and inclusive agreements
6. The Milk and St. Mary Rivers	The Milk and St. Mary Rivers are shared between the U.S. and Can. Between the state of Montana and the provinces of Alta and Sask	Boundary Waters Treaty IJC - 1921 Order of the Commission	Apportionment of the Milk and St. Mary Rivers between the two countries.	IJC - Procedures Manual of water of the Accredited Officers	The 1921 order provides for joint officers. Montana-Alberta Water Management Initiative (WMI)	Public process/hearings on 1921 order. IJC established St. Mary / Milk Rivers Administrative Measures Task Force with public input for 2003 review. Representation on the WMI	Yes	WMI represents a “bottom-up” rather than a federal government led “top-down” approach to transboundary water management and the engagement of local interests

Case Study	Geography	Legal Basis	Purpose & Function	Implementation Arrangement	Members	Role of Local Interests	Stakeholder Participation	Comments relative to Columbia River Basin
Accepted For Analysis Continued								
7. Murray Darling River	Australia (Not International) – significant watershed in eastern Australia	2007 federal <i>Water Act</i> – Murray Darling Agreement	co-ordinate effective planning and management for the equitable, efficient and sustainable use of the water and other natural resources of the Murray–Darling Basin	Murray-Darling Basin Authority (MDB)	Various Committee's advise the MDBA. The MDBA and its Committees' membership represent government, academics, agricultural professionals, industry, aboriginal groups	Various Committee's advise the MDBA representing diverse interests. Basin Community Committee – local interests	Yes	Authority advised by several separate committees. An example of a decentralized water governance regime becoming more centralized.
Not Accepted For Analysis								
8. Prairie Provinces Allocations (Possible)	Prairie Provinces of Canada: Alberta, Saskatchewan and Manitoba (Not International).	1969 Master Agreement between Provinces	Apportionment of water resources between Provinces	Prairie Provinces Water Board	Board Members are senior officials from the Canadian Federal government and the Provincial governments of Alberta, Saskatchewan and Manitoba.	Not apparent		Not international no clear local government involvement upon initial review.
9. Nile Basin Initiative	Longest river in the world; shared by 11 countries – Tanzania, Uganda, Rwanda, Burundi, Republic of the Congo, Kenya, Ethiopia, Eritrea, South Sudan, Sudan & Egypt	Cooperative Framework Agreement	Cooperatively develop & manage the Nile River Basin	Nile Council of Ministers & Technical Advisory Committee	Water Ministers of 10 States	Local people & NGOs provide input & advice via the Nile Basin discourse	Yes	There seems to be much to learn from this arrangement; not clear on authority, but lots of joint initiatives
10. Tri-national Commission of the Trifinio Plan	Biosphere reserve in El Salvador, Guatemala, & Honduras Lempa, Uluá, & Motagua river basins	Treaty (1998)	Develop & implement Trifinio Plan – provide access to water, citizen participation etc.	Commission, Secretariat & Advisory Committee	Vice-Presidents of 3 countries	Local govts, 45 munis, & NGOs regularly participate on Advisory Committee	Yes	Considered a model of bottom-up regional integration; citizen participation within & across countries
11. Mekong River Basin Commission	China, Myanmar, Thailand, Laos, Cambodia, & Vietnam	Mekong Agreement	Promote & coordinate sustainable development of water & related resources	Commission, Secretariat	Thailand, Laos, Cambodia, Vietnam	Local people & NGOs provide input & advice	Yes	Not all riparians involved; limited local involvement; limited authority
12. International St. Croix River Watershed Board	International river basin in New Brunswick & Maine	IJC Boundary Waters Treaty	Manage water quality & quantity	St. Croix Watershed Board	IJC appoints	Seeks to help local stakeholders in resolving local problems		Not its own Int. Agreement; operating under IJC Boundary Waters Treaty
13. Skagit River, Ross Lake and Seven Mile Treaty	Watershed between BC & Washington State	Treaty	The Sale of power from BC to Seattle in exchange not raising the height of the Ross dam that would flood part of BC.			Negotiated by local officials.		Good Example of Local officials involvement in an international treaty negotiation - More Corporation Involvement than local government

Case Study	Geography	Legal Basis	Purpose & Function	Implementation Arrangement	Members	Role of Local Interests	Stakeholder Participation	Comments relative to Columbia River Basin
Not Accepted For Analysis Continued								
14. Lake Tanganyika Authority	Global hotspot of biodiversity; Zambia, Tanzania, Burundi, & Republic of Congo	Convention on Sustainable management of Lake Tanganyika	Ensure protection of biodiversity & sustainable development	Ministers, Secretariat, & Technical Committees	4 riparian countries	Local people & NGOs provide input	Yes	
15. International Lake of the Woods Control Board	Watershed covering parts of Manitoba, Ontario and Minnesota	Bi-national Convention	Lake of the Woods Convention and Boundary Waters Treaty	International Lake of the Woods Control Board under IJC	Canada and the US	No Apparent local involvement on Board		Little apparent local involvement
16. Estonian-Russian Transboundary Waters Commission	Largest transboundary lake in Europe shared by Estonia & Russia	Inter-governmental agreement	Exchange information & jointly monitor for water quality	Commission	National ministries, border guards, regional & local authorities	Local people & NGOs provide input & advice	Yes	Limited scope & purpose
17. International Commission for the Protection of Lake Constance	Large lake shared by Germany, Austria, & Switzerland	International agreement	Monitors water quality; provides guidance;	Commission, along with 200 affiliated transboundary groups &		Local people & NGOs apparently active	Yes	Limited scope, purpose, & authority; focused on information exchange
18. International Commission for the Protection of the Danube River	19 countries - 10% of continental Europe	Danube River Protection Convention	Facilitates cooperation on water management	Commission, Secretariat, Expert Work Groups	14 countries & European Union	Local people & NGOs provide input & advice	Yes	Largely a coordinating body; limited authority & benefit sharing
19. Lake Victoria Basin Commission	Africa's largest lake and the world's 2 nd largest lake; Kenya, Tanzania, & Uganda	International protocol in sustainable development	Harmonize law, policy, & management	Sectoral Council (Ministers) & Secretariat and Working Groups	Secretaries of all relevant Ministries from the 3 Partner States	Local people & NGOs provide input & advice	Yes	Largely a coordinating body; limited authority & benefit sharing
20. Skagit Watershed Council	Watershed between BC & WA	NGO	Support sustainable fisheries	Board of Directors & "work groups"	Any organization that supports the mission	None currently involved		Limited in scope & authority; demonstrates the value of NGOs – Not an international agreement btwn States
21. Fraser Basin Council	Southern British Columbia	Non-profit	Sustain the unique social, economic and environmental value	Board of Directors	Members represent federal, provincial, local, and First Nations governments;	Involved	Yes	Not an international agreement btwn States
22. Missouri River Recovery Implementation Committee	Missouri River Basin (529,350 sq. miles) 7 states, 28 tribal nations	Advisory committee authorized by Congress	Develop & implement ecosystem management	MRRIC Multi-Stakeholder	70 members appointed by Corps of Engineers	20 of 28 Aboriginal tribes participate regularly	Yes	Not International model

Case Study	Geography	Legal Basis	Purpose & Function	Implementation Arrangement	Members	Role of Local Interests	Stakeholder Participation	Comments relative to Columbia River Basin
Not Appropriate (Not Accepted For Analysis) Continued								
23. Mackenzie River Basin Board	River basin in BC, Sask., NW Terr., Yukon Terr.	Master Agreement	Coordinate water management	Board	1 aboriginal & 1 govt. rep. from each jurisdiction	Aboriginal Peoples actively involved; no authority per se		Signatory governments fund transboundary forum - not international
24. Yukon River Inter-tribal Watershed Council	Yukon River Watershed (AK, BC, Yukon Terr.)	Inter-tribal Accord	Protect & enhance water quality	YRITWC	Only indigenous groups	Aboriginal Peoples catalyzed, founded, & govern	Yes	Illustrates the value of indigenous leadership
25. Comprehensive Everglades Restoration Plan	18,000 square-mile ecosystem in South Florida	Agency initiative and federal legislation	Coordinate restoration activities	Working group includes local, state, tribal, and federal			Yes	Not transboundary; good model of coordination & adaptive management
26. Organization of the Amazon Cooperation Treaty	Bolivia, Brazil, Colombia, Ecuador, Guyana, Peru, Suriname and Venezuela	Amazon Cooperation Treaty	Affirms individual sovereignty & encourages, institutionalizes & guides regional cooperation; reconcile growth & environmental protection	Ministers of Foreign Affairs, Amazon Cooperation Council, Secretariat, & other coordinating bodies	All signatories to the Treaty	Coordinating Office for Indigenous Affairs; local people & NGOs provide input & advice	Yes	Fosters coordination & joint initiatives on economy & environment; no regional authority per se